

Projectvoorstel embedded researchers creative industries

Applying organisation

VU – CLUE
Research cluster Heritage in a Postcolonial World

Title

CRISP (PCPD)
Creative Industries and Sustainable Protection of Cultural Heritage – Dutch Policies in the Post Conflict Middle East and North Africa

Keywords

- Sustainable development
- Illicit trafficking prevention
- UNESCO Conventions
- Dutch heritage sector and 'Matra-Zuid'
- monitoring tools in existing databases

Project description

Motivation

Dutch government assists directly and indirectly (via the UN and the EU) in transitional developments in other countries, as is currently at stake in the Arab region (northern Africa and the Middle East), where five priority countries have been selected for specific support in their democratic transition process: Tunisia, Egypt, Morocco, Jordan and Libya. Support focuses on economic growth (and a.o. employment of young people and women), democratization (free elections) and the building of a constitutional state (a.o. freedom of the media). This so-called 'Matra Zuid' programme also offers possibilities for projects in the fields of education, culture and media, provided that these contribute to the democratization process and long term processes of polity development. CRISP aims to contribute to MATRA-Zuid by creating operational links between UNESCO Conventions, notions of cultural sustainable development and Dutch international heritage cooperation. To this end, CRISP can build on an existing active partnership between VU-CLUE, the Inspectorate of the Ministry of Education Culture and Science, the Netherlands National Committee for UNESCO (NatCom), and Prince Claus Fund (CER), connected to developments at UNESCO head Quarters in Paris and activities of a number of other NatComs.

Many countries suffer the loss of their cultural heritage through theft, illegal excavation or unlawful export, often during the phases of a conflict (war, civil war, other uproar for instance related to land disputes) or immediately after a disaster. This loss may have a strong impact on both the history of society and state and on the historical and cultural awareness of its peoples. Various measures to recognize and protect cultural heritage on a local, national and

international level have been taken, in the course of time. The first discussions on this theme were held by the intergovernmental organization League of Nations (the precursor to the United Nations) and reach back to the end of the First World War. This concern was later taken up by UNESCO, which since its forming in 1945, immediately after the Second World War, is actively involved in the cultural heritage field with a.o. legal instruments regarding the protection and safeguarding of cultural property both tangible and intangible, in different circumstances and situations.

The first key international legal instrument of UNESCO was the Convention for the protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflict and its Protocol (1954), followed in 1999 with a Second Protocol. In the negotiations during the Diplomatic Conference in The Hague in 1954 (there were also diplomatic conferences in The Hague in 1899 and in 1907), a compromise was achieved between humanitarian and military requirements. According to Patrick O' Keefe and Lyndel Prott ((2011) the basic principle stated in the Preamble of the Hague Convention that 'the cultural property belonging to any people should receive international protection' is one of the founding principles for the development of all international heritage law. Relevant to CRISP are other UNESCO Conventions as well, like (in brief): 1970 Convention on preventing illicit trade, 1972 World heritage convention, 2001 Underwater convention, 2003 Intangible heritage convention, and 2005 Cultural diversity convention. Except for the Underwater heritage convention, the Netherlands are State Party to all these conventions.

Ever since the Hague Conventions, the Netherlands has been committed to the protection of cultural property from armed conflict, while since the 1990s also acknowledging the importance of a cultural sector for sustainable development (including tourism). It is acknowledged that projects in the field of culture, education and media can stimulate peace and community development. But between legal instruments and the practice of the military, of peace keeping operations, of policy and of (financial or technical) assistance by (inter)national organisations, ngo's and cultural institutions during the phases of (post) conflict relief and reconstruction, a gap can be detected. After a conflict, safety, infrastructure, health care and social economic development are prioritized. Cultural projects are a minor or even a neglected part in the supporting activities of reconstruction in a country, as was also shown in the Dutch integrated approach in Afghanistan between 2002 and 2010 (an integrated approach involving the Ministries of Foreign Affairs, Defence, Economic Affairs, Justice and Internal Affairs) (NatCom 2011). Nevertheless, small-scale cultural projects in Afghanistan have been undertaken. An example is the Prince Claus Fund with the Cultural Emergency Response Program (CER), aimed at projects at the interface of conflict and culture. CER, providing direct action towards stabilizing or rescuing cultural heritage damaged or under threat by natural disasters or conflict, has contributed to several reconstruction projects in Afghanistan. (Klein Goldewijk et al. 2011) UNESCO and several international cultural institutions contribute to cultural projects in Afghanistan as well. Examples are the training of Afghan craftsmen in restoration techniques and the reconstruction of the National Museum in Kabul and its surrounding gardens, the palace of Kholm and of the destroyed Buddha statues in Bamyan. Unesco has a PCPD-platform,

facilitated by a sharepoint closed database for UNESCO staff only, where policies are developed, experiences shared and projects are monitored.

These experiences, legal frameworks and practices are starting point for CRISP, that intends to strengthen the role of cultural heritage institutions in achieving the aims of Matra-Zuid. This new Dutch Matra-Zuid programme does not start in a situation of military intervention, as was the case in Afghanistan. Nevertheless, the lessons learned from the NatCom's quick-scan of the culture, education and media projects in Afghanistan (2011) are relevant to this new programme. These have shown that insecurity, the presence of (foreign) military forces, a complex political and tribal situation, a limited capacity of government partners, corruption, lack of coordination and of institutional memory within the international community can be major obstacles to sustainable development programmes. The aim of cultural heritage policies is to prevent cultural plunder and illicit trade, and to contribute to the material and immaterial cultural protection, to set up frameworks and strategies for the safeguarding and protection of damaged cultural heritage, including intangible heritage, bearing in mind to sustain peace and social cohesion processes and to support intercultural dialogue and reconciliation. Reviving the tourist industry provides a special challenge in this context. The important question is how this aim of cultural heritage policies can be achieved.

Project outline

CRISP takes the MATRA-ZUID programme as its starting point, with a special focus on Dutch heritage cooperation with Tunisia, Egypt, Morocco, Jordan and Libya. Heritage cooperation against cultural loss and for sustainable development is a multilateral process, engaging the cultural (public) sectors of both the target countries and the donor countries (in our case specifically the Netherlands). The experiences in Afghanistan and how Dutch involvement in Afghanistan resonated in the Dutch heritage sector, will provide a valuable starting point to develop our understanding of these two directions in cultural cooperation. (NatCom 2011, Legêne 2008) Research will be undertaken by a team of two embedded researchers: Marja van Heese, who will start from the UNESCO legal framework; Tessa VerLoren van Themaat, focusing on the heritage sector and researching international heritage cooperation.

Marja van Heese is a senior Inspector at the Ministry of Education, Culture and Science. As a 'buitenpromovendus' at VU (CLUE) she also works on a PhD regarding UNESCO, Dutch Government and the protection of cultural heritage. CRISP will provide a dedicated academic context to speed up the research process, which up to now is entwined with her work as an Inspector. CRISP connects to other chapters of her PhD that also discuss this theme, for instance on the meaning of ratification of Cultural Conventions, the history of cultural protection in conflict situations, the importance and meaning of culture for societies in conflict situations and a comparison with the situation in former Yugoslavia.

Tessa VerLoren van Themaat is a young researcher who in 2012 graduated *cum laude* on an MA-history thesis on cultural identity formation in the Netherlands.

She also studied UNESCO policies as part of her MA-curriculum. She aims at an academic career connected to both the heritage sector and universities. Her capability to do so was evident during her MATHesis research for the Dutch Open Air Museum on creating criteria for collecting 'Holland symbols'. The nine months embedded research in CRISP will further broaden her scope and enable her to develop a solid outline for a PhD thesis.

Research will focus on the following:

- a) Monitoring tools of UNESCO Conventions, the fight against illicit trafficking of cultural heritage and the potential of UNESCO World Heritage Sites and Intangible Heritage Inventories for sustainable development (Van Heese)
 - Cultural safe havens and the meaning and effectiveness of international cultural conventions in the case of Afghanistan and in the five Matra-Zuid countries prioritized by Dutch government
 - The legal protection framework for cultural heritage in the five countries and their impact in transition times
 - Inventory of cultural activities that have or can be undertaken in the five countries in the context of each of the UNESCO conventions: what could be successful

- b) Evaluation of national cultural policy: what happened in the five countries at stake (van Heese/VerLoren van Themaat)
 - How was cultural heritage protected during and after crisis situations by the military, ngo's, law enforcement agencies, local communities, international cultural organizations; what lessons can be learned?
 - Which role does the local community now play in the light of education and drive back the unemployment figures

- c) How did the Dutch heritage sector respond to the intense Dutch (military) involvement in Afghanistan between 2001 and 2010 and how will matra-Zuid resonate in the Netherlands (VerLoren van Themaat)
 - Analysis of the cultural productions (exhibitions, theatre performances, book translations, movies and tv-productions and other initiatives): both content, visitors response to exhibitons, print run of books etc., other follow up activities
 - Evaluation of the kind of cultural interactions and their possible contribution to sustainable cultural development in the two countries concerned
 - plans and projects in the Dutch cultural sector and other stakeholders (like tour operators)

- d) Conclusions and recommendations (Van Heese/VerLoren van Themaat)
 - How can long term goals be named and guaranteed in the definitions of reconstruction or transitional phases; what is UNESCO's impact in this respect?
 - What can we expect from the Dutch heritage sector in PCPD-policies in reconstruction and transitional phases, both within the Netherlands and

in the countries at stake, and what lessons from Afghanistan do we bring to Matra-Zuid?

- How can we develop an open sharepoint MATRA-Zuid knowledge platform, parallel to UNESCO's closed PCPD-platform, in support of international cultural heritage cooperation?

Project approach:

The two researchers will be embedded in both the Ministry of Education, Culture and Science (contributing in kind), and Amsterdam Campus. Their research will support the campus' programme pillars of "research" and "events/matchmaking".

CRISP Project leader is prof. dr. Susan Legêne, (VU/CLUE), who also will be supervising the two PhD projects that CRISP will accommodate/initiate. The current NatCom PCPD-working group chaired by Legêne and in which CER, ministry of Foreign Affairs, representatives of the Dutch museum sector, SICA, Free Press Unlimited and other stakeholders collaborate, will support the researchers. The outcomes will be presented at an event organized at Amsterdam Campus in collaboration with this UNESCO working group and SICA (that is to say: the organization that will emerge out of the current merger of SICA with two other organizations). Besides, CRISP can be regarded as a follow-up project within CLUE, regarding policy evaluation and advice (Westrik, Schmid, Bosma, Legêne and others); as such it will also benefit from the CLUE Heritage Cities symposium in preparation for 2013.

Emphasis during the 9 months initial stage of CRISP will be put on inventorizing (visual and textual archival) sources, views and regulations relevant to the questions developed here. Apart from relevant literature study, the researchers will base their research on questionnaires for relevant partners in the (inter)national field. Interviews will be made at the national and international level: a.o. NatCom, policy advisors Ministries of Foreign Affairs, Defense, PCF/CER, UNESCO HQ and NatComs of Norway, Germany, UK/Canada, Interpol, ICOM, experts in the field. Besides, both relevant heritage institutions in the Netherlands as well as commercial sectors like art traders, auction houses and tour operators will be interviewed on how they relate their work to international heritage law and UNESCO policies and conventions.

References:

- *2007 Prince Claus Awards, Culture and Conflict*, Prince Claus Fund, The Hague 2007
- Heese, M. van, 'Iraq and the Second Protocol to the 1954 Hague Convention', in: N. van Woudenberg and L. Lijnzaad (ed.), *Protecting Cultural Property in Armed Conflict, An insight into the 1999 Second Protocol to the Hague Convention of 1954 for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict*. Leiden/Boston 2010, 135-145
- *International Meeting on illicit traffic of cultural property*, Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali, Rome 2009

- Klein Goldewijk, B, G. Frerks, E. Van der Plas, *Cultural Emergency in Conflict and Disaster*, Prince Claus Fund, NAI Publishers, Rotterdam 2011
- Legêne, S., 'Contramine – Pleidooi voor een historische tentoonstellingskritiek', *Tijdschrift voor Geschiedenis* 121:4 (2008) 462-269
- Legêne, S., *Lessons Learned: interventies in post-conflict situaties*, inleiding UNESCO/SICA PCPD-seminar 26-9-2011
- Ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken, 'brief aan de Eerste Kamer over de actuele situatie in de landen in de Arabische regio', Den Haag, 10-2-2012 en 26-3-2012
- NatCom, *Culture, Education and Media Projects in Afghanistan, What lessons can be learned*, The Hague 2011
- 'Notitie: wederopbouw na gewapend conflict en beleidsbrief Ontwikkelingssamenwerking, brief van de ministers van Buitenlandse Zaken en voor Ontwikkelingssamenwerking aan de Tweede Kamer', Den Haag 15-11-2007 (Kamerstukken 30 075 en 31 250)
- O'Keefe, P. J., and L. V. Prott, *Cultural Heritage Conventions and other Instruments, a Compendium with Commentaries*, IAL, 2011
- Prott, L. V., *Witnesses to History, A Compendium of Documents and Writings on the Return of Cultural Objects*, UNESCO Paris 2009
- Sigsgaard, M. , *Education and fragility in Afghanistan, A situational analysis*, UNESCO, IIEP, INEE, Paris 2009
- UNESCO, *The hidden crisis: Armed conflict and education, Summary*, Paris 2011

Other publications, by Marja van Heese:

- in voorbereiding: A. Brokerhof, N. Duggen, M. van Heese 'To have and to hold: behoud en bescherming van archieven in Nederland' (werktitel), publicatie in Kluwer Handboek Archieven, tweede helft 2012
- 'The Implementation of the 1970 UNESCO Convention in the Netherlands', in: *The Cambrian Law Review*(publicatie mei 2012)
- 'Mobility of Collections', publicatie van lezing tijdens conferentie over Collectiemobiliteit in Nederland en in de EU, Rouse, Bulgarije op 4 december 2009, in: *Museum Exhibition Fair*, Rouse 2010, pp 12-16
- 'Bescherming cultureel erfgoed: ratificatie en implementatie van het UNESCO-verdrag 1970', in: *Juriwijs*, mei 2008, jaargang 3, nummer 7 (met mr L. Schouten), pp 4-7
- 'Ethical commitments and seizure risks', in: R. Afman, R. Knoop, *Moving Heritage, Managing Movable Heritage in the EU: Bulgarian-Dutch Experiences 2005-2008*, Driebergen-Sofia 2008, pp. 221-229
- 'Activities in the Netherlands regarding the protection of cultural heritage', in: R. Afman, R. Knoop, *Moving Heritage, Managing Movable Heritage in the EU: Bulgarian-Dutch Experiences 2005-2008*, Driebergen-Sofia 2008, pp. 212-220
- 'Bescherming van het culturele erfgoed van Irak: van nationaal en internationaal belang', in: *Juriwijs*, Januari 2008, jaargang 3, nummer 6, pp 13-15
- 'Illegale handel in beschermd cultureel erfgoed uit Irak', in: *Kunst en Antiek Journaal*, Juni-juli 2007, 12^{de}jaargang, nr 7 (met dr D. Meijer), p 10

- 'Recent Developments in the Netherlands after the Conference *Illegal Trade Rotterdam 2004*', in: A. Hanno e.a., *Strategies for Saving our Cultural Heritage*, Papers presented at the CSSIM/ICOM-LIC Meeting in Cairo, Athens 2007, pp 234-237
- 'De Erfgoedinspectie en de bescherming van het (Europese) cultureel erfgoed', in: *Erfgoedverhalen voor Charlotte van Rappard-Boon*, Den Haag 2007, pp 157-162
- 'The Dutch Approach to the Fight against Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods', in: *Art Antiquity and Law, Institute of Art and Law*, March 2006, vol. XI, Issue 1, pp 85-91
- 'Il controllo dei traffici illeciti di opere d'arte in Olanda', in: *Bollettino di Numismatica, Comando Carabinieri tutela patrimonio artistico, Roma*, 12-16 giugno 2000, pp 271-281, 412
- 'Bouwputten en valkuilen, bouwen in musea', in: *Museumvisie* 3-1998, pp. 4-7

Planning (9 months)

| | |
|------------------|--|
| Sept –Oct 2012 | Literature research, developing two position papers by Van Heese and VerLoren van Themaat |
| October 2012 | International expert meeting, convened by NatCom PCPD working group (discussing position papers, as well as providing first opportunity for interviews) |
| Nov. 12-April 13 | Research phase; regular feedback sessions within both CLUE (Bosma, preparing WHC-symposium in 2013) and NatCom PCPD working group |
| April 2013 | NatCom/Sica event: discussion with heritage sector and policy makers of project outcomes, with as policy outcome: coordinated focus of Dutch heritage sector on MATRA-Zuid policy aims and options; broader understanding of UNESCO legal frameworks, its strengths and weaknesses |
| June 2013 | Final project output: for Van Heese, a chapter in her Ph on the protection of cultural heritage; for VerLoren van Themaat, an outline for a PhD project. Together: a monitoring tool concerning international (heritage) cooperation in transitional societies. |

Budget calculation:

This budget calculation is not final, due to time constraints. However, we can assure that the necessary budgets are available, and we will work on finetuning the calculations below. The budgets available at NatCom are aimed at the work of the PCPD working group, exceeding CRISP. However, for CRISP these meetings convened by the working group will provide important stepping stones in the research process and as such these funds do match.

Salaries:

| | |
|--|--------|
| Van Heese (in kind: Ministry OCW) 9 months 0,2 fte | 7.500 |
| Van Heese projectbudget 9 months 0,4 fte | 15.500 |
| VerLoren van Themaat (MA) 9 months 0.6 fte | 10.500 |

Research costs:

| | |
|---|-------|
| Benchfee van Heese | 1.500 |
| Benchfee VerLoren van Themaat | 1.500 |
| Developing Dutch share point site with UNESCO Paris | 1.000 |

Events/matchmaking

| | |
|---------------------------------------|--------|
| NatCom budget PCPD working group 2012 | 11.000 |
| NatCom budget PCPD working group 2013 | 13.500 |

Total **62.000**

Budget available

| | |
|----------------------|--------|
| In kind Ministry OCW | 7.500 |
| NatCom | 24.500 |

Budget application: **30.000**

Societal impact

Policy interventions in culture, education and media in (post) conflict and post disaster situations (PCPD) is a major focus of the programme of the Netherlands National Committee for UNESCO (NatCom), since 2007. Over the years various expert meetings have been organized, resulting in various policy reports as well as an evaluation report based on a quick scan of Dutch interventions in these fields in Afghanistan between 2001 and 2010. Based on these findings, NatCom now focuses on the policy guidelines and actual interventions in culture, education and media in North Africa and the Middle East ('Matra-Zuid'). Sharing the knowledge and insights acquired in the context of NatCom, strengthening the international networks of cultural agents that are active in this field, as well as advising Dutch government about UNESCO subjects, it is an important aim of NatCom to set up a specific approach and policy regarding cultural assistance, enduring interventions and (inter)national cooperation in (post) conflict situations. CRISP will contribute to strengthening the scientific research base for this longterm policy oriented NatCom project.

The results of CRISP will be highly relevant for Dutch government, the Ministry of Education, Culture and Science in particular, and in this context also for the Cultural Heritage Inspectorate. The results of this study may benefit the work and activities of the Inspectorate/Ministry of Education, Culture and Science with the increased knowledge in the field of international cooperation and the relevant players in the field, risk indicators for cultural heritage in times of (post)conflict, the kind of emergency structures and cultural infrastructure outlines. Other Ministries involved in this theme that will benefit from the outcomes are Finance, Foreign Affairs and Defense.

CRISP also will be a support for the development of the intersectional platform on PCPD of UNESCO in Paris (share point). The research outcomes will be the basis for further international consultation and cooperation, which will lead to strengthening Dutch, (EU) and UNESCO's capabilities to act on the platform of Post Conflict Post Disaster. This may offer a contribution to the actual protection and safeguarding of cultural heritage in transitional countries in the broad sense, with the open sharepoint platform as an example for other countries involved in a (post) conflict heritage policies.

The Dutch heritage sector may benefit from the project in that it supports them with insight into the way these institutions may contribute to Dutch international policies, and how this resonates within Dutch society, thus strengthening the capacity of relevant Dutch heritage institutions to broaden their activities connected to developments outside of the Netherlands, and relate their work to UNESCO policies and practices.

Risks and killing assumptions

None of the risks indicated in the application form are at stake in CRISP. The project builds upon the ongoing NatCom programme that so far has been successful and appreciated both by the Dutch Ministry and by PCPD platform of UNESCO in Paris.

A risk is the share point PCPD-platform in Paris. This (closed) platform is in development. CRISP intends to develop a comparable share point within the Netherlands, with the MATRA-Zuid priority countries as pilot cases. This is rather ambitious, given the experimental stage of the UNESCO Paris PCPDPlatform. However, we would like to give it a try, in order to work towards parallel structures, that might be linked, if the tools work well.

Feasibility

Van Heese has already ample knowledge in the field of cultural legislation and (inter)national cultural institutions, she has a broad network and has published in international peer reviewed journals. VerLoren van Themaat has been an effective intern at Meertens Institute, answering a research question by the Dutch Open Air Museum, which resulted in a highly appreciated MA thesis. The expectation is that both can finalize the project within the given time. Legêne is well embedded both in the research environment of UNESCO and of the (international) cultural heritage sector concerned and will be able to secure commitment and access to relevant resource persons.

Organisation:

Coordination:

VU/CLUE, Susan Legêne, professor of political history, member of NatCom and chair of NatCom PCPD working group

Project staff:

Drs. Marja van Heese, inspector Cultural Heritage Inspectorate, Ministry of Education, Culture and Science, 'buitenpromovendus'

Tessa VerLoren van Themaat, MA history, PhD candidate

Private partner(s):
NatCom, SICA, Ministry of Education Culture and Science/Inspectorate

Deliverables

Van Heese: Position paper at expert meeting;
A finished PhD-chapter, to be published in
peer reviewed journal

VerLoren van Themaat: Paper, to be presented at expert meeting; outline
and research plan for follow up PhD project

Van Heese and VerLoren van Themaat: Conclusions and recommendations
for heritage sector concerning MATRA-Zuid
programme
Pilot sharepoint site concerning UNESCO and
Matra-Zuid

Technique

Developing open platform under share point, parallel to UNESCO Paris closed
platform

Criteria waarop projectvoorstellen worden beoordeeld - Het project is:

- Alfa intensief
Starting point is research into cultural interventions in post conflict and other
transitional situations and the value of UNESCO heritage policies and practices.
- heeft sterke digitale component (ehumanities)
CRISP contributes to toll development, by setting up an open platform, parallel to
an existing closed platform at UNESCO in Paris.
- heeft een private component
Both Ministry of OCW and NatCom are involved and contribute in kind, cash and
networks
- eventueel een publieke component (erfgoedinstelling)
Heritage institutions are involved through a policy and output evaluation that
focuses on mutuality in PCPD interventions
- leidt tot concrete product, of producten
Better understanding of the workings of international heritage laws and
conventions, guidelines and lessons learned
- is Duurzaam
Critical evaluation of notions of sustainability in cultural interventions
contribute to sustainable international policy guidelines in the context of Matra-
Zuid
- is technisch haalbaar
the networks for informants and feedback are in place